Biological research in support of stingless beekeeping in Australia

Tim Heard, Honorary Associate, University of Sydney Director, Sugarbag Bees tim@sugarbag.net

## Overview

- Introduction to Stingless bees
- Stingless beekeeping in Australia
- Recent research that has supported the practice of Stingless beekeeping
  - Taxonomy
  - Domestication
  - Natural enemies and defence mechanisms
  - Studies on the products of hives: propolis and honey,
  - Queen replacement
  - Fighting swarms
  - The flight range and homing behaviour
  - Effect of habitat type on colony success
  - Use of these bees as crop pollinators.

## Stingless bees

- Apidae: Meliponini
- The "other" group of highly eusocial bees
- C. 500 species globally,
  - 11 in Australia,
  - approximately 40 in malaysia
- Meliponiculture: stingless bee keeping



## Global diversity of stingless bees



Natural History Museum, UK

## Phylogeny of stingless bees

Rasmussen and Cameron 2007



## Stingless bee diversity in Australia

11 species in two genera:

– Tetragonula

– Austroplebeia



**Photos: Tobias Smith** 



#### Australian and New Guinean Stingless Bees of the Genus *Austroplebeia* Moure (Hymenoptera: Apidae)—a revision

## Austroplebeia australis

Wide distribution, particularly common in drier areas from Hunter Valley to the Kimb<u>erley</u>





#### Tetragonula carbonaria -Excellent species for keeping -Model study organism



## Stingless bee nest Batumen Nest wall

Honey storage pots-

Pollen storage pots -

Mature brood cells.

Young brood cells

Involucrum

Photo: Dan Coughlan

## Honey bee nest Stingless bee nest



## Australian stingless bee species Hive volume

Scientific name	Worker length (mm)	Nest volume (litres)	Brood volume (litres)	Brood structure	External entrance tunnel	Common name
Tetragonula carbonaria	4	8	2	Regular comb	No	carbonaria
Tetragonula hockingsi	4.5	10	2	Semi-comb	No	hockingsi
Tetragonula davenporti	4	8	2	Semi-comb	No	davenporti
Tetragonula mellipes	4	4	0.5	Semi-comb	Usually	mellipes
Tetragonula clypearis	3.5	4	0.5	Cluster	Usually	clypearis
Tetragonula sapiens	4	4	0.2	Cluster	Usually	sapiens
Austroplebeia australis	4	5	0.5–1	Cluster	Variable	australis
Austroplebeia cassiae	4	8	1–2	Cluster	Usually	cassiae
Austroplebeia magna	4	2	0.5	Cluster	Usually	magna
Austroplebeia essingtoni	3.5	1	0.2	Cluster	Usually	essingtoni
Austroplebeia cincta	3.5	4	1	Concentric layers	Yes	cincta

# Transferring a nest into an artificial hive



# Transferring a nest into an artificial hive



# Transferring a nest into an artificial hive



## Get the bees into the box



## Temperature regulation

Highly social bees maintain standard temperature in nest, even in cool conditions







## Stingless beekeeping -dividing a hive



## Stingless beekeeping -dividing a hive



## Stingless beekeeping -dividing a hive



## Split through advancing front



## Queen replacement

# Highly social behaviour

- Cooperative brood care
- Presence of castes (inflexible)
- No solitary phase in life cycle of colonies
- Perennial colonies



Photo: James Dorey

## Males and females Photos: Justin Bartlett

#### Male

#### Female worker



## Queen production

Queen cells Photo: Jeff Willmer

Males roosting outside nest, towards nightfall

**Photo: Corrine Jordan** 

## Mating



- Takes place outside nest, on the wing
- Queen only ever does one mating flight
- Males form a congregation in anticipation
- Queen flies through the male congregation
- She mates with one male
- Return to nest and use the stored sperm for rest of her life

## Queen replacement: Emergency queen cells

### Emergency queens in *Tetragonula carbonaria* (Smith, 1854) (Hymenoptera: Apidae: Meliponini)

Túlio M Nunes,1\* Tim A Heard,2 Giorgio C Venturieri23 and Benjamin P Oldroyd1



Fig. 3. (a) Brood comb of Tetragonula carbonaria in a queenright colony. Note the spiral shape of the brood comb. (b) Brood comb of T. carbonaria 1 week after queen removal showing royal-sized cells ('a') constructed by workers, provisioned with food and capped without egg laying.



Fig. 4. (a) Mature brood comb of Tetragonula carbonaria from a queenless colony showing an emergency queen cell attached to an empty auxiliary cell on the top. (b) Queen larva of T. carbonaria adjacent to an empty brood cell.

## Budding (eduction or softsplitting)



Connect a hive to a nest, with the intention of budding off a new colony into the hive







## Budding (progress over time)







Week 12 First brood seen Week 16 Bud box disconnected

## Stingless bee-keeping -results of surveys

	1998	2010
No of beekeepers (n)	257	637
No of nests (n)	1425	4935
Most popular species	T. carbonaria (69%) T. hockingsi (20%)	T. carbonaria (61.5%) A. australis (23%)
Nest locations		
Suburban	56%	67%
Near bush	24%	21%
Rural	20%	13%
Suburban + bush		18%
Reasons for keeping bees	(%)	(%)
Enjoyment	81	78
Conservation	68	67
Pollinate bushland	27	29
Pollinate crops	24	24
Crops pollination services		1
Honey production	8	11
Hives sales	5	4
Education	2	12
Research	2	4

## Natural enemies Syrphid fly: *Ceriana ornata*

Wasp-mimicking adult

Images: Jeff Willmer



## Phorid fly (Dohniphora)

## Adult (right) compared to stingless bee (left)

Larvae destroying a colony of stingless bees



## Defence behaviour

- Nest wall, Entrance and tube
- Biting
- Resin applying
- Removal of damaged brood
- Use of plant resins



Image: Paul Cunningham



## Defence behaviour

#### Resin applying



Fig. 3 a Ejected adult small hive beetle covered in sticky globules of resin. b A. australis worker 'riding' adult beetle out of hive entrance

Insect. Soc. DOI 10.1007/s00040-010-0142-x

Insectes Sociaux

RESEARCH ARTICLE

Behavioral defense strategies of the stingless bee, *Austroplebeia australis*, against the small hive beetle, *Aethina tumida* 

M. Halcroft · R. Spooner-Hart · P. Neumann

Naturwissenschaften DOI 10.1007/s00114-009-0631-9

SHORT COMMUNICATION

#### The alternative Pharaoh approach: stingless bees mummify beetle parasites alive

Mark K. Greco · Dorothee Hoffmann · Anne Dollin · Michael Duncan · Robert Spooner-Hart · Peter Neumann



Fig. 1 A T. carbonaria worker mummifies a live small hive beetle by

## Defence behaviour

 Hygienic behaviour,
Removal of damaged brood (Shanks 2014)







### Brood pathogen (Shanks disease)

Identification of *Lysinibacillus sphaericus* bacterium as the causative agent (Shanks et al., in press)



## Defence behaviour

- Nest wall, Entrance and tube
- Biting
- Resin applying
- Removal of damaged brood
- Use of plant resins



Image: Paul Cunningham



## Plant resins are biologically active containing:

- Flavonoids known to be antimicrobial
- Terpenoids known to repel ants and other enemies





Photo: Anne Dollin

Photo: Glenbo Craig

## Propolis and stingless bees chemical ecology

- Resin is important in nest recognition (Leonhardt et al .)
- Propolis diversity aids colonies (Drescher et al. 2014)
- Flavonoids are antimicrobial (Massaro et al. 2015)
- Terpenes are repellant (Norton 2016)

Cadaghi tree (*Corymbia torreliana*)





## African tulip tree

Poisonous nectar, can kill bees seems to be a minor problem at worst

#### **Dead bees in flower**

Photo: Flavia Massaro



# Honey production





### Honey

- Commercialisation of a bush tucker
- Composition
  - High water content
  - High acidity
  - Unusual sugars

JOURNAL OF MEDICINAL FOOD J Med Food 11 (4) 2008, 789–794 © Mary Ann Liebert, Inc. and Korean Society of Food Science and Nutrition DOI: 10.1089/jmf.2007.0724

#### Short Communication

Composition and Antioxidant Activity of Trigona carbonaria Honey from Australia

Livia Persano Oddo,<sup>1</sup> Tim A. Heard,<sup>2</sup> Antonio Rodríguez-Malaver,<sup>3</sup> Rosa Ana Pérez,<sup>4</sup> Miguel Fernández-Muiño,<sup>5</sup> María Teresa Sancho,<sup>5</sup> Giulio Sesta,<sup>1</sup> Lorenzo Lusco,<sup>1</sup> and Patricia Vit<sup>6</sup>

	Average± SD
Moisture (g/100 g honey)	26.5±0.8
Electrical conductivity (mS/cm)	1.64±0.12
Ash (g/100 g honey)	0.48±0.06
HMF (mg/kg honey)	1.2 $\pm$ 0.6
рН	4.0±0.1
Acidity (milliequivalents/kg honey)	128.9 ± 23.3
Nitrogen (mg/100 g honey)	202.3± 191.2
Diastase (DN)	0.4±0.5
Invertase (IN)	$5.7\pm1.5$
Fructose	24.5±1.9
Glucose	17.5 ± 2.8
Maltose	20.3±2.9
Sucrose	1.8±0.4
Fructose + glucose	42.0±4.5
<b>T</b>	

## Antimicrobial activity of honey



International Journal of Antimicrobial Agents 32 (2008) 89-98

Agents

Antimicrobial

www.ischemo.org

Article

pubs.acs.org/JAFC

Letters to the Editor

Antibacterial activity of honey from the Australian stingless bee *Trigona carbonaria*  The antibacterial activities of the 22 samples of *Trigona* honey are shown in Table 1. The initial total antibacte-

#### Peroxide vs Non-peroxide activity

Leptospermum honey Leptospermum honey + catalase Brush box honey + Brush box honey catalase Journal of Applied Microbiology Journal of Applied Microbiology ISSN

ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Antimicrobial activity of honey from the stingless bee *Trigona carbonaria* determined by agar diffusion, agar dilution, broth microdilution and time-kill methodology

K.L. Boorn<sup>1</sup>, Y.-Y. Khor<sup>2</sup>, E. Sweetman<sup>2</sup>, F. Tan<sup>2</sup>, T.A. Heard<sup>3</sup> and K.A. Hammer<sup>2</sup>

#### AGRICULTURAL AND FOOD CHEMISTRY

In Vitro Antibacterial Phenolic Extracts from "Sugarbag" Pot-Honeys of Australian Stingless Bees (*Tetragonula carbonaria*)

C. Flavia Massaro,  $^{*,\dagger}$  Daniel Shelley,  $^{\dagger}$  Tim A. Heard,  $^{\$}$  and Peter Brooks  $^{\dagger}$ 

## Antimicrobial activity of honey



Carbonaria honey

Honey bee manuka honey

## Antimicrobial activity of honey -where is it from?

Honey comb of Apis mellifera

Made of WAX

Honey pots of

Tetragonula carbonaria

#### Made of **PROPOLIS**





## Propolis

## Propolis can be collected and sold as a valuable product





Fighting swarms

## Peculiar behaviour of *Tetragonula*

Bees hovering in circular motion

## Fighting swarms

#### **Bees hovering facing the entrance**

**Photo: Tobias Smith** 

## Fighting swarms

#### Bees fighting to the death



Fighting swarms are caused by an attacking colony attempting to usurp the nest of the defending colony





Fighting swarms are caused by an attacking colony attempting to usurp the nest of the defending colony

Nest defence in a stingless bee: What causes fighting swarms in *Trigona carbonaria* (Hymenoptera, Meliponini)?

R. Gloag<sup>1</sup>, T.A. Heard<sup>2</sup>, M. Beekman<sup>1</sup> and B.P. Oldroyd<sup>1</sup>

VOL. 184, NO. 6 THE AMERICAN NATURALIST DECEMBER 2014

NATURAL HISTORY NOTE

1

2

### Bees at War: Interspecific Battles and Nest Usurpation in Stingless Bees

John Paul Cunningham,<sup>1,\*</sup> James P. Hereward,<sup>2</sup> Tim A. Heard,<sup>3</sup> Paul J. De Barro,<sup>4</sup> and Stuart A. West<sup>5</sup>

## Inter-specific colony usurption

 Tetragonula hockingsi usurps nests of T. carbonaria







*Fig. 3.* Mean percentage of bees (n = 100 bees per distance) that returned to the colony when released between 100 and 700 m from the colony (error bars indicate ± one standard deviation).

Austral Entomology (2016) ••, ••–••

Flight range of the Australian stingless bee *Tetragonula carbonaria* (Hymenoptera: Apidae)

Jordan P. Smith,<sup>1</sup> Tim A. Heard,<sup>2</sup> Madeleine Beekman<sup>1</sup> and Ros Gloag<sup>1\*</sup>

# Flight range (500m radius around nest)

#### Sub-urban area

#### Natural area



## Homing behaviour

J Comp Physiol A DOI 10.1007/s00359-016-1100-5

ORIGINAL PAPER

## **Resources or landmarks: which factors drive homing success in** *Tetragonula carbonaria* foraging in natural and disturbed landscapes?

Sara D. Leonhardt<sup>1</sup> · Benjamin F. Kaluza<sup>1,2,3</sup> · Helen Wallace<sup>2</sup> · Tim A. Heard<sup>4</sup>



Most bees returned in the natural forests and gardens, but in farm landscapes many never made it home. This information gives us insight into how stingless bees navigate. Their ability to get home in natural, seemingly homogeneous habitats surprised us. Perhaps they use complex combinations of visual objects or olfactory landmarks?



Performance of colonies in diverse environments

### **Ecology and Evolution**

Open Access

## Urban gardens promote bee foraging over natural habitats and plantations

Benjamin F. Kaluza<sup>1,2,3</sup>, Helen Wallace<sup>2</sup>, Tim A. Heard<sup>4</sup>, Alexandra-Maria Klein<sup>5</sup> & Sara D. Leonhardt<sup>3</sup>

Increase in hive numbers in different landscapes 120 100 --Garden 80 ---Forest 60 **—**Farm 40 20 0 2011 2012 2013 2014 2015

## Communication of food sources -honey bees

- The "waggle dance"
- Workers follow the scout and feel her movement



FIGURE 15.11. The tail-wagging dance of *Apis mellifera*. The upper worker is dancing in the pattern indicated; she is followed and antennated by other workers. (From Frisch, 1967a.)

### Communication of food sources -stingless bees

• *Tetragonula carbonaria* can communicate direction but not distance (Neih et al 1995)



## Pollination of crop plants Macadamia



# Unlike honey bees, stingless bees have the following advantages:

- Generally harmless to humans and domesticated animals
- Preservation of biodiversity
- Colonies are unable to abscond as the old queen is flightless
- They are resistant to the diseases and parasites of honey bees
- Short flight ranges (typically 500 m) keeps them in crops

## Flight range of stingless bees vs honey bees

**Rural area** 

**Urban** area

2 km honey bees

200 m stingless bees Disadvantages of stingless bees for crop pollination include:

- Lack of availability of large numbers of hives
- Limited to warmer part of the globe
- Some species fight when placed in close proximity

## Positioning hives



### The proportion of bees collecting pollen of the target crop for five crop species



Bees collecting pollen of target crop

Competition between crops: Strawberry vs macadamia



## Summary

- Introduction to Stingless bees
- Stingless beekeeping in Australia
- Recent research that has supported the practice of Stingless beekeeping
  - Taxonomy
  - Domestication
  - Natural enemies and defence mechanisms
  - Studies on the products of hives: propolis and honey,
  - Queen replacement
  - Fighting swarms
  - The flight range and homing behaviour
  - Effect of habitat type on colony success
  - Use of these bees as crop pollinators.

## Thank you!

tim@sugarbag.net www.sugarbag.net

> Facebook: Sugarbag Bees



## New book available at www.NativeBeeBook.com.au

## The Australian Native Bee Book

by Tim Heard



Keeping stingless bee hives for pets, pollination and sugarbag honey